



Strategies used to Motivate Teachers in Kenya: A case of Rural and Urban Primary Schools in Embu and Kirinyaga Counties, Kenya

Ngare A. M.*, Njoka J. N. and Mwaruvie J. M.
Karatina University, P.O. BOX 1957—10101, Karatina, Kenya

***Corresponding author's email address:** ngareamunyua@gmail.com

Abstract

Teachers play fundamental role in the development of human resource in the world. The motivation of teachers significantly influences their effectiveness in the quest of producing desired educational outcomes in learners. The purpose of this study was to assess the strategies used to motivate teachers in rural and urban primary schools in Embu and Kirinyaga in Kenya. The objective of the study was to examine the strategies used to motivate teachers in rural and urban primary schools in Embu and Kirinyaga counties. It was hypothesized that there is no statistically significant difference in motivation among teachers in rural and urban primary schools in Embu and Kirinyaga counties. The study adopted a descriptive survey research design and the target population consisted of 583 primary schools distributed as follows, rural (464) and urban (119). A sample of (58)10% of the schools was selected from the population and proportionately distributed, thus Rural (38) and urban (20) schools. From each of the sampled schools three (3) teachers were selected one representing the lower, upper primary and the head teacher, thus the sample comprised of 174 respondents. The overall computed mean scores of motivations of teachers for rural schools was ($\bar{x}$ = 3.11) and urban schools ($\bar{x}$ = 3.08). These mean scores indicated that on general scale rural schools had slightly better motivation strategies compared to urban schools, although the levels of motivation were average in both school categories. Testing the null hypothesis using t-test established that there was no significant difference between the levels of motivation between teachers in rural and urban primary schools. The study recommends the need to investigate the working conditions of teachers, opportunities for career development, remuneration, availability and adequacy of resources and leadership styles in schools as causal factors to low teacher morale in primary schools in Embu and Kirinyaga Counties.

Keywords: motivation, rural, urban, strategies, academic achievement, instructional materials

INTRODUCTION

The link between education and development cannot be over-emphasized. UNESCO (2015) state that development in majority of countries in Sub-Saharan Africa (SSA) may be compromised by low quality of education being provided in schools. This problem is partly attributed to low teacher motivation, especially in public schools. Several studies have revealed that SSA is faced with a crisis in teacher motivation of unprecedented magnitude that is so dire that it compromises attainment of educational goals (Pitsoe 2007; Bennell & Akyeampong 2007; Harding & Mansaray 2005). In Kenya, there are concerns pertaining to deteriorating quality of education and subsequent decline in learners' academic achievement in rural based primary schools which pose a great challenge to the education system. The agenda 2030 of the United

Nations consists of 17 Sustainable Development Goals (SDGs) that ought to be met by the year 2030. The fourth goal, namely; “to ensure inclusive and equitable quality education for all and encourage lifelong learning,” is concerned with education (UNESCO, 2016). Therefore, to achieve this goal it is important to address the low teacher morale.

By 2040, Africa's rural population is expected to reach 147 million people (United Nations Development Planning, UNDP, 2009). According to the survey, Africa will have 0.8 billion rural residents by 2050, while rurality in the developing world is decreasing as a result of urbanization. According to the UNDP (2009) Africa Rural Population Study, the demand for rural education and teachers will rise as the rural population grows. However, some teachers are refusing to work in rural areas because of concerns about the quality of housing, classroom facilities, social services, and access to health and recreational facilities (Akyeampong & Stephens, 2002). Additionally, teachers have shown reservations towards being posted in rural areas as a result of the profound deprivation and isolation of the villages characterized by lack of modern facilities and access to opportunities for further education (Hedges, 2002). Further, when a school lacks female teachers the girl child misses the opportunity to interact with role models in the course of their education programme (Rihani, 2009). Furthermore, unlike students in impoverished neighborhoods, students in urban areas are fortunate to be exposed to social life and can easily understand what their teachers teach and pass their exams. As a result, several countries report that teachers have a clear preference for urban schools, owing to the fact that teachers' success is primarily determined by their students' accomplishments, rather than the facilities available, instructional resources, or the school's location (Ankomah, 2005).

Statement of the Problem

The motivation of teachers continues to be a subject of great concern among educationists and policy makers. There are various strategies that are used to motivate teachers that are both intrinsic and extrinsic. Psychological studies have demonstrated that a motivated workforce produces desired results. Studies indicate that primary school education provides a sound foundation for the future life of an individual. There is hence the need to have a motivated teaching force at this very instrumental level of education that will be able to inculcate the requisite knowledge and values in learners necessary for academic pursuits and future citizenship in the country. There has been a great concern by various education stakeholders regarding the motivation of teachers in Embu and Kirinyaga counties in Kenya. The examination results of most learners from public primary schools from the two counties in the recent years have been below the average mark of 250 scores out of a possible 500 marks. This performance has hence raised grave concerns regarding the level of motivation of teachers from the two counties. This study set to assess the strategies used to motivate teachers in rural and urban primary schools in Embu and Kirinyaga counties in Kenya with a view to provide empirical data to address the matter.

Purpose of the study

The purpose of the study was to assess the strategies used to motivate teachers in rural and urban primary schools in Embu and Kirinyaga in Kenya.

Objectives of the study

The study was guided by the following objective, which was to;

- i. Assess the strategies used to motivate teachers in rural and urban primary schools in Embu and Kirinyaga in Kenya.

Hypothesis of the study

The study tested the following null hypothesis;

Ho: There is no statistically significant difference in motivation among teachers from rural and urban primary schools in Embu and Kirinyaga Counties in Kenya.

METHODOLOGY

The research was conducted using a descriptive survey research design and adopted Herzberg's (1959) motivation-hygiene theory. The motivation-hygiene theory identifies two factors that influence employee efficiency in the workplace. The hygiene factors (working conditions) are referred to as dissatisfiers, while the motivation factors (psychological factors) are referred to as satisfiers. If hygiene considerations are not present, an employee may work less. If motivating factors are present, an employee would be encouraged to work harder. The target population consisted of 583 primary schools which were distributed as follows, rural (464) and urban (119). Mugenda and Mugenda (2003) states that a sample of 10-30%, is representative in descriptive studies. Using the lower limit of 10% a sample of (58) schools was selected from the target population and proportionately distributed as follows: Rural (38) and urban (20) schools. From each of the sampled schools three (3) teachers were selected one representing the lower, upper primary and the head teacher, thus the sample comprised of 174 respondents. The justification of the choice of three teachers to represent the lower and upper sections was based on the reason that every class has one class teacher since most schools are single streams. The choice of the head teacher was due to the reason that they are the leaders of the schools. Data was collected using questionnaires of which the return rate was 172 which was 97.7%. Table 1 provides a summary of the population and sample distribution.

Table 1. Population and Sample size

	School Category	No. of Schools	No. of Schools Sampled (10%)	No. of Teachers Sampled	Questionnaire Return Rate
1.	Rural	464	46	138	137(99.3%)
2.	Urban	119	12	36	35(97.2%)
	Total	583	58	174	172(97.7%)

The reliability of the instrument was ascertained using the Cronbach alpha technique which gave a coefficient of 0.764 which met the threshold of 0.7 by Kerlinger (2000) for descriptive studies. The collected data was analyzed using the descriptive and inferential statistics and presented using tables.

LITERATURE REVIEW

Teacher motivation is instrumental in the achievement of quality learning by students and the attainment of desired educational outcomes. Governments and education stakeholders have recognized the critical role of high levels of teacher motivation in promoting high-quality teaching and learning in schools. As a result, schools, parents, and other stakeholders have put in place policies to strengthen teachers' working and professional conditions in order to increase their motivation (Sirma & Poipoi, 2010). The Global Campaign for Education report (2005) regretted that even after the achievements of Education for All (EFA), cultivating motivation among teachers continue to be a concern for educational policy makers at all levels. Consequently, teacher morale has continued to plummet, as a result of inordinately large class sizes,

poor teacher education programmes, inadequate number of teachers in schools resulting in work overload and poor remuneration (Global Campaign for Education, 2005).

Hoy and Miskel (1991) argue that motivation is a major variable that brings about work-related behaviour towards positive or negative achievement in the work places. In this regard teachers can be said to be “highly motivated” if they strive for individual goals achievements and the teaching profession ideals. Conversely, “lowly motivated teachers” are those that put minimal effort or willingly to harness their personal capabilities towards attainment of objectives and goals in their schools. Velez (2007) describes a motivated teacher as one who is inspired and encouraged to perform the best professionally. According to Gardner (2005) the motivation of teachers strongly impacts on learners’ drive in learning. Spear, Gould and Lee (2000) asserted that there are diverse factors that affect motivation of teachers. They found the main factors to teacher’s satisfaction and motivation as working with the children. Moreover, dissatisfaction with work was largely attributed to poor remuneration, overload, and sensitivities of public perceptions towards them. Teachers in the United Kingdom, according to Spear, Gould, and Lee (2000), need intellectual challenge, a high degree of professional autonomy, to believe they are benefiting society, to have good relationships with their colleagues, and to spend a sufficient proportion of their time interacting with children to experience high job satisfaction. Improved pay and rank, a lighter workload, and less administrative tasks do not, however, guarantee job satisfaction.

Allen and Helms (2002) contend that motivation is a strategy of recognizing people for their good work performance as well as acknowledging their contribution towards attainment of the organization’s goals. Organizations achieve these goals if the motivation schemes are associated to the organization’s strategies. Arguing in a similar vein, Nelson (2004) states that, most workers like to be recognized by their managers when they perform well in their work. They like to be praised in a sincere and timely manner. Similarly, Torrington (2002) agrees with this view and adds that individuals should be acknowledged and motivated for their effort in work. This builds a sense of identity and confidence which leads to better performance. Aacha (2010) concurs with these sentiments and points out that non-financial motivation for instance recognition and contentment have higher significance in the teachers’ motivation to work efficiently. Workplaces, according to Wayne (2006), should have a favorable climate, capital and material resources, as well as professional and knowledgeable human resources. These conditions motivate workers as well as allow them to participate in setting and assessing goals.

Further, according to Odden (2000), teachers can also be motivated by good performance of learners, attaining new skills, recognition and personal growth. However, according to Lawler (2003), financial incentive seems to be extremely important in an organization, because if an organization wishes to recruit and retain employees, it must pay them well. Aswathappa (2003), in support of Lawler's argument, claims that financial incentives are a powerful motivator for an individual worker or a group of employees. As a result, money is required to complete the mission. Unless employment is voluntary, employees regard compensation as a reward for their efforts, while employers regard it as a reward for employing the worker's services. This viewpoint demonstrates teachers' attitudes toward their students' success by suggesting that when teachers' expertise and motivation are used to assess their compensation, teacher productivity will increase.

According to Kadzamira (2006), monetary factors such as remuneration levels, material benefits, and non-monetary factors such as working and living conditions have a significant impact on primary school teacher motivation and job satisfaction. According to Aacha (2010), there is a significant link between intrinsic motivation and teacher work efficiency, implying that both intrinsic and extrinsic factors influence teacher performance. In a contrasting view Onanda (2015) asserts that, trust, respect and high expectations by most of teachers are forms of motivation. Thus, teachers need self-respect from the school administration and their colleagues and other stake holders. He also found that teachers' promotion and growth are motivational factors that enhance their performance. Onanda (2015) therefore concludes the need for the school managers to motivate the staff to enhance the school performance. Kornberger and Pitsis (2005) established that teachers will find satisfaction in teaching if it is lively, sensible, significant and meaningful and when they find to be worthwhile, important and have justifiable control over its affairs and activities and can exert agreeable influence on their events. Waga and Simativa (2014) state that the best way to attract the best brains into the teaching profession is by giving attractive terms of service, especially conducive working condition, remuneration and do away with any respect that may harm the status and reduce the teacher's morale.

Berger (2002) indicates that to attract, retain teachers, reward and motivate them a compensation program need to be developed. Over-expensive compensation should be avoided by the school administration carefully planning the compensation mode for their teachers and make them feel motivated. He further says there is need to make teachers feel wanted and important and show them that their well-being matters. There is no specific one- method-fit-all style of compensating workers as the economy and institution situations fluctuate most of the times. This is the reason why it is paramount for all education institutions to give serious attention to their compensation policy. Programs for compensating teachers should be internally equitable, individually motivating and externally competitive. Berger (2002) says personal compensation is popularly advised but easily said than done. Therefore, motivation is all that is related to the amount of the extrinsic and intrinsic rewards given to the workers. A good example of motivation is what is known as a cafeteria plan, where employees can choose what helps them the most. Financial compensation is one method of motivating workers, according to Herzberg, but it does not lead to job satisfaction. Wage, on the other hand, should be commensurate with the amount of time spent working and the quality of the work produced. Armstrong (2007) asserts that if money given does not satisfy an employee, money converts into job dissatisfaction. Pay is an extrinsic motivator which does not originate from the job itself but ensures the work quality is maintained and sees to it the basic rules of the work are followed by the employees.

Apart from financial motivation there is non-financial compensation that centres on the need that workers require. These needs are achievement needs, influence needs, responsibility and individual development. Most of these non-financial compensations are mostly intrinsic motivators which emanate from the work itself (Thomas 2002). Most employees have a feeling of satisfaction and they get feeling of success from that job and hence get more motivated to do the work. More examples of non-financial compensation include: extended lunch hours, flexible work time, support by the administrators, appreciation, work projects which are interesting and enjoyable, time off, paid for needs at the work place, extended vacation period and/or movie tickets (Stone 2003). Few employers provide health benefits and insurance coverage to their employees as a form of compensation, either by paying a portion of the premium or paying the entire premium. Payment of the entire workers' insurance, is very expensive for the employer, but it is likely to improve the workers' health, resulting in a

significant reduction in sick leave days, and thus an increase in productivity. This insurance payment for the workforce demonstrates to the employer how much priority they place on their employees. The insurance payment can also be looked as a good way to attract new persons to join the profession/work and also, a way of retaining the motivated employees already in the job. Compensation which is non-financial is the best in motivating employees and increases workers satisfaction.

On the other hand “cafeteria plan” can be used by the employer as an employee benefit plan, where the workers choose the best suitable benefit for individual workers from a possible list of benefits (Rosenbloom, 2005). Cash, childcare assistance, life insurance, retirement benefits, paid leaves, and even assistance for the treatment of disabled family members such as employees, infants, or spouses are all popular cafeteria plan options. Each and every worker as per his/her need is given an opportunity to identify the best option benefits package. Rosenbloom (2005) gives an example of a female worker planning to bear children in the near future may select payment for health insurance or baby care, on the contrary, an elderly worker would prefer retirement benefit account. The cafeteria plan's biggest gain is that the employer won't have to pay for benefits that aren't chosen. Employer cafeteria plans encourage employers to provide more benefits to their employees. As a result, workers value the variety of flexible benefits available, which can inspire them to stay with the company. According to Hofstede (2005), a motivating factor for one worker might not be a motivating factor for another. Good pay and interesting and enjoyable job may motivate a large number of employees. Other considerations include the fact that the order in which people are motivated differs depending on their level of education, financial circumstances, cultural differences, and other job contexts. The work motivation study is not limited to a single type of culture. Cultural values distract how individual workers select work environment stimuli. These serve as ways of interpreting and evaluating motivational techniques. Motivational practices are therefore evaluated according to their ability to fulfill collective self-directed desires.

According to Mullins (2007), job satisfaction comprises of a number of various dimensions and a big range of variables related to individuals, cultural, environmental, social and organizational factors, affects its level. As a result, Mullins recommends that an organization seeking job improvements and high-level work success from its employees should pay close attention to cultural factors within its workforce. An organization may develop effective strategies, administrative styles, and keep employees highly engaged and happy by recognizing the diversity of the community.

Segun and Olanrewaju (2011) assert that the pursuit of the right education in African rural areas, it is highly stressing since education system is already burdened. This therefore automatically leads to great challenge in preparing, recruiting, supporting and motivating teachers who offer quality education in both rural and urban schools. Consequently, teachers in rural areas should be given opportunities to upgrade their pedagogical skills through in-service training. Education managers according to Ingersoll (2001) have problem in identifying qualified teachers who can comfortably teach in rural schools and stay in the job. Ingersoll (2001) identifies two paramount considerations for the recruitment of teachers in these areas, the rural schools' educational needs and teachers trained to meet the unique rural area's needs. Teacher recruited to teach in rural areas, to motivate and retain them it is advisable they should be the locals since it is believed their personal history and connection to their family might entice them. This approach is in the believe that their community may appreciate them as well as be in close proximity to their relatives and hence ensure their living standards stability.

However, in some countries, such as Malawi, teachers are reportedly unwilling to work in their hometowns due to a plethora of demands from relatives or family members. Other teachers prefer the countryside to their cities.

Several studies have shown that teachers recruited from rural areas are unwilling to return to their communities (Rust and Dalin, 1990; Azam, 2001). Teachers recruited from these areas see education as a means of social mobility, and as a result, they are hesitant to return to their hometown after completing their teacher training (Azam, 2001).

According to Azam (2001), it is difficult to recruit teachers to rural areas in Lesotho because of the harsh conditions. As a result, it is prudent to devise a scheme for teacher recruitment that favors teachers from specific areas. This study reveals that teacher deployment in most African countries is neither equitable nor effective. The majority of trained and experienced teachers are concentrated in urban schools, resulting in urban teachers becoming more fulfilled and motivated than their counterparts in rural areas. Rural schools struggle to motivate, attract, and retain skilled and experienced teachers. Political interference is a major concern in the recruitment and employment of teachers in most African countries. The recruitment process is contended to be patron-oriented and politically influenced.

The issue of teachers' motivation and working environment in most of the rural schools in the African continent has been criticized because there are so many hardships rural schools face in their quest to attract and retain qualified teachers (Markel, 2004). A good working environment influences the quantity and quality of information student's gain, as well as their ability to enhance their growth and development. It also influences their sense of security. Rural schools are not appealing to highly skilled and motivated teachers due to persistent high poverty, low pay, a deplorable climate, limited opportunities for professional development, geographical and social isolation, and other factors. Working conditions have consistently played a large role in teachers' decisions to abandon or relocate the profession, according to Markel (2004)'s research on teacher conditions in North America. Low administrative support, availability of teaching/learning tools, teacher input in decision-making, and the school climate are all strongly linked to staying in the teaching profession or migrating.

According to Jordan (2006), a motivated teacher provides good guidance that result in positive learning outcomes, which leads to the development of comprehensive and long-lasting skills, attitudes, and information. The visible characteristics of an effective teaching revolves around six key indicators: The way learning space is configured and classrooms organized, classroom discipline and management, structuring and planning of the curriculum, the teaching styles and strategies, self-directed strategies and peer tutoring.

Most of the rural areas in Africa, there are inadequate teaching staff for the existing classes. As a consequence, multi-grade instruction occurs, in which a teacher instructs more than one grade at the same time. Despite the fact that schools have been built, Mulkeen (2005) observes that school attendance is low in Uganda, especially in the Karamoja region. This is really demotivating and dissatisfying to teachers and kills their teaching morale. The Ugandan government introduced a program where children are taught under trees as they take care of their livestock which is referred to as Alternative Basic Education for Karamoja (ABEK). In this program, a single teacher supervises each school. A similar program like ABEK which is fit for nomadic education is practiced in north of Nigeria.

Multi-grade approach of teaching has been adopted by many African countries as a key instructional tool that can assist teachers to work in difficult situations. Multi-grade strategy of teaching is potentially capable of improving the teaching quality hence contribute to global effort to achieve EFA goals. However, it is not until a teacher is adequately skilled in handling multi-grade strategy for it to succeed. The situation that forces a teacher to use multi-grade teaching without undergoing extra training and being provided with additional instructional materials, results in straining teachers and decreasing the quality of education and teachers' motivation and satisfaction (Benveniste & McEwan, 2000). Multi-grade teaching asks for more work, teachers' resources are also on high demand both emotional and cognitive.

Segun and Olaurewaju (2011) quoting Sammons et al (1995), identified eleven factors leading to classroom effectiveness as, learning environment, teaching and learning concentration, purposeful teaching, great expectations and positive reinforcement. The rest are; monitoring process, professional leadership, shared goals and vision, learner's rights and responsibilities, community-school partnership and learning organization. The first six originate directly from the classroom whereas the last five shape the cultural-social setting (milieu) of the school and produce an environment in which effective teaching exists. On the list teacher discipline is included as a route to classroom effectiveness and improvement. Effective classroom management and discipline in rural areas create additional hardship for school managers and administrators. Teachers' absenteeism is a major concern in these areas which causes critical constraints in realizing effective classroom management and learners' discipline (Mulkeen, 2005). He also asserts that some teachers in Uganda devote fewer hours to teaching than those committed to their private work. This is seen as a way of complementing their inadequate pay and looking for compensation.

Mulkeen, (2005) identifies physical remoteness of most of the locations of rural schools and some teachers being involved in moon-lighting activities as major hindrances to effective teaching and encourages teacher absenteeism. In some African countries, teachers travel long distances to access banking services to collect their pay, again this can lead to absenteeism of up to three days. In Uganda teachers are expected to be paid through their bank account but some places have no bank at all, hence the government is forced to pay in cash and obviously demanding teachers to travel a long distance to collect their salary, by all means this is very demotivating. Moreover, this causes painful constraint on the management of the teaching and classroom discipline.

Teachers' medical issues in rural areas can reduce teacher control and discipline. A visit to a medical center/clinic that takes a teacher in an urban area just a day or hours can cause a teacher in a rural area to miss three days of work. Teachers in rural areas are often separated from their families and primary care physicians. It takes time for them to travel from their rural schools to see their physicians. In this case it is unfair to associate difficulties in management of classrooms as entirely on the teachers' behavior. Systems failure also leads to undermining the teachers' morale. Failure to pay teachers promptly, delayed upgrading and transfer damage the system and lowers the teacher morale. Teachers in rural areas feel ignored by the authorities and believe they have been handled unfairly in terms of transfers, promotions, and other basic benefits. Teachers' morale is lowered as a result of these expectations, which could lead to disciplinary issues (Jordan 2006).

According to Mulkeen (2005), curriculum planning and structuring is having some difficulties, especially in rural areas. In Uganda, for example, it is the duty of head

teachers in public schools to arrange pay increases and changes for their teachers. If a school is located in a remote location, the head teacher would be absent from the school for such a noble cause for a longer period of time, obstructing his or her ability to supervise curriculum preparation, execution, and planning. Furthermore, schools located far from the education office are unlikely to be inspected by outside inspectors. In Malawi, for example, it has been observed that teacher absenteeism is higher in rural areas because the climate is more comfortable and education officers' visits are less frequent. In remote rural areas, evaluation and teacher supervision by other local community stakeholders is extremely weak. The local communities do put little emphasis on the value of education, this is likely due to the fact they have little education themselves and underrate their ability to challenge the teachers' authority and knowledge.

A district school in Tanzania is required to be inspected every two years by the Tanzanian government. In districts with a limited number of campuses, all of them must be externally supervised once a year. In areas with more than 80 schools, at least half of the schools must be inspected. Unfortunately, due to a lack of transportation, financial restrictions, and geographical factors such as flooding, weak road networks, infrastructure, and isolation, schools in remote areas are unlikely to be visited. The majority of these visits do not provide an appraisal or evaluation of education quality, and they only provide schools or the education ministry with limited information on teaching quality. The implication of these failures on curriculum planning and structuring can never be emphasized and thus cascades to teachers being dissatisfied, demotivated and demoralized (UNESCO, 2009).

Most of the countries in Africa undervalue the teaching profession. This is proved by the rigidity depicted by governments towards teachers demands particularly who are not well paid and it has turned into a job which people join after failing to get another. Low salaries of teachers in comparison with other workers in different sectors and profession with a comparable education levels and years of experience, for example low teacher salary and the method in which it is paid is most contentious thing among teachers in most of the African schools (VSO, 2002).

In Nigeria, there has been local and national state teachers demanding sufficient salaries and good living standards. The same has been happening in Kenya, where the teachers' trade unions, Kenya National Union of Teachers (KNUT) and Kenya Union of Post Primary Education Teachers (KUPPET) have been seen strongly agitating for higher salaries and allowances for their members leading to national strikes lasting even for a month. By the year 2002, the average gross monthly salary for a primary school teacher in Nigeria, as well as many other African countries, was about one dollar. In an analysis of teacher salaries in a northern Nigerian province (VSO, 2002). In this state, the minimum subsistence expenditure for a teacher with a spouse and at least two children is about \$400 per month, compared to a salary of \$100 per month. Consequently, most teachers find themselves involved in additional income generating projects to complement their low earnings, obviously affecting their general effectiveness. It's unfortunate there are no opportunities for teachers in remote areas to get involved in private tutoring of learners like their counterparts in urban areas, mainly because poverty is widespread in these areas.

Career advancement and chances to further studies are extremely limited among teachers in rural areas. Low motivation of teachers is high in these places. In many African countries, politicians and education policy makers have focused on urban education, assuming all is well in rural district schools. Brown (2003) claims that this

apparent political indifference is due to a lack of political will to improve rural areas, claiming that since the votes that elected them did not come from the rural population, they are not responsible for the plight of rural citizens. The most unfortunate thing is some education officer use deployment, transfer and posting of teachers to rural areas as a way of punishing undisciplined teachers. Teachers in rural areas have challenges which range from recruitment to retaining them in the job.

RESULTS AND DISCUSSION

The study was guided by one objective;

The objective sought to assess the strategies used to motivate teachers in rural and urban primary schools in Embu and Kirinyaga counties in Kenya. Data was collected by means of a questionnaire consisting of 11 items in a five-point Likert scale that ranged from strongly disagree (1), disagree (2), not sure (3), agree (4) and strongly agree (5). The responses obtained were used to compute a mean score and a standard deviation for each statement. The mean scores ranged from 1-5 and were interpreted as follows; 1.00-2.33 (agree), 2.34-3.67 (not sure) and 3.67-5.00 (disagree). In addition, a mean score was computed for all the 11 statements and used to rate the effectiveness of strategies used to motivate teachers in rural and urban primary schools in Kirinyaga and Embu Counties. Table 2 provides a summary of the findings.

These findings from table 2 indicate that salary could have been a motivating factor to teachers especially from urban areas because they indicated as being happy with their salaries. This is in agreement with a study by Kadzamira (2006) which established that primary school teacher motivation and work satisfaction is highly determined by monetary factors such as remuneration levels, other materials benefits and other non-monetary factors particularly working and living conditions. On whether salaries were paid in time, teacher from rural areas responded thus; 12(8.8%) agreed, 2(1.5%) were not sure and 122(89.7%) dis-agreed, the mean score ($\bar{x}$ =4.22) indicated that generally the rural teachers disagreed with this statement. Responses of urban teachers on the same statement were; 0(0.0%) agreed, 2(5.7%) were not sure and 33(94.2%) dis-agree, mean score ($\bar{x}$ =4.37) indicated that the respondents disagreed with this statement. The study established that the salaries of both rural and urban teachers were not paid in time. Failure by the employer to pay salaries in time may have a demotivating influence of teachers' job performance. This concurs with Aswathappa (2003) who contends that finance is considered a great motivator to an individual worker or a group of workers. Hence, money is fundamental for the teacher's task's completion. On whether the school management offered teachers extra teaching allowances; 96(70.6%) agreed, 16(11.8%) were not sure and 24(17.6%) dis-agreed, the mean score ($\bar{x}$ =2.13), showed that the respondents were on average in agreement with this statement. The responses of urban teachers were; 21(60.0%) agreed, 8(22.9%) were not sure and 6(17.1%) dis-agree, the mean score ($\bar{x}$ =2.40) indicated that on average the respondents were undecided. Aacha (2010) asserts that there is a critical relationship between intrinsic motivation and teachers' work performance, this implies that both intrinsic and extrinsic factors do affect the performance of teachers.

Table 2. Strategies used to Motivate Teachers in Rural and Urban Primary Schools

		School Category	Agree	Not Sure	Dis-agree	n	$\bar{x}$	s
1.	Education officers regularly visit our school to monitoring teaching.	Rural	12(9.0%)	5(3.7%)	117(87.3%)	134	3.99	.81
		Urban	2(5.7%)	2(5.7%)	31(88.6%)	35	3.97	.66
2.	I am happy with my salary.	Rural	87(64.9%)	8(6.0%)	39(29.1%)	134	2.39	1.25
		Urban	25(71.4%)	4(11.4%)	6(17.1%)	35	2.06	1.19
3.	Teachers are involved in decision making in the school.	Rural	31(22.8%)	18(13.2%)	87(64.0%)	136	3.46	1.12
		Urban	4(11.8%)	2(5.9%)	28(82.4%)	34	3.76	.85
4.	Teachers who perform well are recognized and awarded.	Rural	63(46.3%)	29(21.3%)	44(32.4%)	136	2.77	1.17
		Urban	13(37.1%)	7(20.0%)	15(42.9%)	35	2.94	1.37
5.	Teachers' salaries are paid on time.	Rural	12(8.8%)	2(1.5%)	122(89.7%)	136	4.22	.91
		Urban	0(0.0%)	2(5.7%)	33(94.2%)	35	4.37	.60
6.	The school has adequate and appropriate furniture for teachers.	Rural	59(44.0%)	15(11.1%)	60(44.8%)	134	2.98	1.24
		Urban	12(34.3%)	4(11.4%)	19(54.3%)	35	3.14	1.03
7.	The school management offers teachers extra teaching allowances	Rural	96(70.6%)	16(11.8%)	24(17.6%)	136	2.13	1.21
		Urban	21(60.0%)	8(22.9%)	6(17.1%)	35	2.40	1.14

8.	The school offers teachers with day meals.	Rural	95(70.9%)	9(6.7%)	30(22.3%)	134	2.17	1.28
		Urban	24(68.6%)	1(2.9%)	10(28.6%)	35	2.26	1.29
9.	The teacher's washrooms are well maintained.	Rural	58(43.0%)	11(8.1%)	66(48.9%)	135	2.96	1.25
		Urban	19(54.3%)	5(14.3%)	11(31.4%)	35	2.63	1.31
10.	The teachers are fairly treated without any discrimination.	Rural	28(20.6%)	7(5.1%)	101(74.3%)	136	3.68	1.17
		Urban	6(17.6%)	1(2.9%)	27(79.4%)	34	3.88	1.25
11	There are in-service trainings organized for the teachers' needs.	Rural	45(33.6%)	22(16.4%)	67(50.0%)	134	3.10	1.15
		Urban	19(55.9%)	9(26.5%)	6(17.6%)	34	2.50	.93

Overall mean scores. Rural schools ($\bar{x}$)= 3.11) Urban schools ($\bar{x}$) = 3.08

When the respondents were asked if education officers regularly visited their schools to monitor teaching. The responses for teachers in rural schools, were as follows; 12 (9.0%) agreed, 5(3.7%) were not sure and 117(87.3%) dis-agree, the mean score ($\bar{x}$ =3.99), indicated that on average the respondents disagreed. Responses for teachers in urban schools were; 2(5.7%) agreed, 2(5.7%) were not sure and 31(88.6%) dis-agree, the mean score ($\bar{x}$ =3.97) revealed that on average the teachers from urban schools disagreed with this statement. When asked whether teachers who performed well were recognized and awarded. Rural teachers responded as follows; 63(46.3%) agreed, 29(21.3%) were not sure and 44(32.4%) dis-agree, the mean score ($\bar{x}$ =2.77) indicated that the teachers were largely undecided. Urban teachers' responses were; 13(37.1%) agreed, 7(20.0%) were not sure and 15(42.9%) dis-agree, the mean score ($\bar{x}$ =2.94) indicated that the teachers were undecided. This concurs with Chijioke and Barber (2010) whose study revealed that schools that are doing well, recognizes and the rewards professional mastery by through nurturing talent among teachers to the level of curriculum specialist. The importance of these school systems put to the teacher performance and excellence recognition and rewarding is what drives in the incentives. These systems do not define excellence as simply the ability of teacher to produce quality learning outcomes but as producing them in the very challenging contents.

When asked if the school had adequate and appropriate furniture for teachers. Teachers from rural areas responded thus; 59(44.0%) agreed, 15(11.1%) were not sure and 60(44.8%) dis-agreed, the mean score ($\bar{x}$ =2.98) revealed that they were generally undecided. The responses from teachers in urban areas were as follows; 12(34.3%) agreed, 4(11.4%) were not sure and 19(54.3%) dis-agreed. The mean score ($\bar{x}$ =3.14) established that on average the teachers were undecided. Nadeem *et al.* (2011) reported that, the social status and teachers' economic conditions have shown to have some significant effects on their performance. These includes low salary, inadequate facilities in schools, their status in society, stress at work, relationship with their colleagues and their head teachers and general working environment. They also contend that when there is low social and economic condition in the area where the school is situated, the level of motivation for teachers is reduced.

On if the teacher's washrooms were well maintained. Responses from rural schools were as follows; 58(43.0%) agreed, 11(8.1%) were not sure and 66(48.9%) dis-agreed, the mean score ($\bar{x}$ =2.96) revealed that the teachers were undecided. In urban schools the responses were as follows; 19(54.3%) agreed, 5(14.3%) were not sure and 11(31.4%) dis-agreed, the mean score ($\bar{x}$ =2.63) revealed that the teachers were largely undecided. Davidson (2005) investigated the teachers' role in the provision of quality education through motivation in primary schools where he found that motivation has a great role in the improvement of education system performance. His study also established that the poor living and working conditions have adversely affected the teachers' performance. Kadzamira (2006) says it is imperative to put into consideration the appropriate work guidelines for the reason of boosting teacher motivation and retention in primary school teachers.

On if there were in-service trainings organized for the teachers' needs. The responses from rural schools were as follows; 45(33.6%) agreed, 22(16.4%) were not sure and 67(50.0%) dis-agreed, the mean score ($\bar{x}$ =3.10) showed that the teachers were not sure. Responses from urban schools were as follows; 19(55.9%) agreed, 9(26.5%) were not

sure and 6(17.6%) dis-agreed, the mean score ($\bar{x}$ =2.50) shows that the teachers agreed with this statement. In Korea, Singapore and Finland, admission into teacher training is selectively done and in-service teachers are highly regarded and treated as competent professionals and self-driven. Teachers are given 100 hours for professional development course fully paid, equivalent to 12 days each year. Tucker (2011) notes that in Finland, Singapore and Japan, quality of teachers has tremendously increased over the last 20 years and they have made the curriculum less directive and how and what teachers teach is very flexible. Such systems create extremely appealing and attractive incentives that encourage professional achievement and horizontal accountability rather than vertical accountability to their seniors. The greatest satisfaction for teachers in these countries is drawn from the ever-growing sense of content and subject mastery together with the increasing ability to positively affect their learners' lives.

When asked whether teachers were involved in decision making in their schools. Teachers in rural areas responded as follows; 31(22.8%) agreed, 18(13.2%) were not sure and 87(64.0%) dis-agree, the mean score ($\bar{x}$ =3.46), indicated that on average the teachers disagreed with the statement. The responses of urban teachers were; 4(11.8%) agreed, 2(5.9%) were not sure and 28(82.4%) dis-agree, the mean score ($\bar{x}$ =3.76) revealed that the teachers disagreed with the statement. Wadesango (2012) claims that teachers need the ability and space to engage in decision-making at a level that is appropriate for them. This is because those who engage in the organization's decisions feel like they're part of a team working for a common goal, which boosts their self-esteem and creative fulfillment. As a result, the teacher involvement strategy can be used to improve organizational partnerships, increase employee job incentives, and increase the rate of knowledge circulation within the organization. Teachers will express their views and share their knowledge with school administrators and fellow teachers by participating in decision-making. This not only strengthens the bond between school leaders and teachers, but it also allows teachers to work together as a team. On whether the schools offered teachers with day meals. Rural teachers responded thus; 95(70.9%) agreed, 9(6.7%) were not sure and 30(22.3%) dis-agreed, the mean score ($\bar{x}$ =2.17) revealed that rural teachers were in agreement with this statement. Responses of teacher from urban schools were; 24(68.6%) agreed, 1(2.9%) were not sure and 10(28.6%) dis-agreed the mean score ($\bar{x}$ =2.26) showed that on average the teachers not sure. When asked whether the teachers were fairly treated without any discrimination. Rural teachers responded thus; 28(20.6%) agreed, 7(5.1%) were not sure and 101(74.3%) dis-agreed, the mean score ($\bar{x}$ =3.68) shows that on average the teachers disagreed with the statement. The teachers from urban schools had the following responses; 6(17.6%) agreed, 1(2.9%) were not sure and 27(79.4%) dis-agree, the mean score ($\bar{x}$ =3.88) indicated that on average the teachers were in disagreement with the statement. Alam and Farid (2011) say that teachers need to be respected, provided with on-job training to surpass their performance and their remuneration be designed in accordance with their capabilities, work experience and skills. This way they will be highly motivated thus increasing their performance.

The study established that both rural and urban based teachers were not sure that; education officers regularly visited their school to monitor teaching, teachers who perform well were recognized and awarded, school had adequate and appropriate furniture for teachers, and teachers' washrooms were well maintained and that there were in-service trainings organized for the teachers' needs. The teachers were however divided in the following; teachers in urban schools were happy with salary while

teachers in rural schools were offered extra teaching allowances and were involved in decision making. Both rural and urban teachers disagreed that education officers visited their schools and those teachers were fairly treated. There was agreement among urban and rural teachers that schools provided teachers with day meals. The overall computed mean scores for rural schools ($\bar{x} = 3.11$) and urban schools ($\bar{x} = 3.08$). These mean scores indicated that on a general scale rural schools had a slightly better motivation strategies compared to and urban schools.

Motivation is thought to have an effect on people's attitudes and success at work. Teacher motivation is directly related to teachers' ability to participate in the pedagogical process and share their experience with students. It decides their participation or non-participation in the teaching activities. Teachers instill educational philosophy and objectives in their students through their experience. Teachers are the most crucial influence in a generation's educational process, so it's critical that they perform to their full potential in the classroom. The authorities of each country must pay close attention to the factors that influence teacher success, which has a direct impact on student achievement. Teachers' motivation is affected by a variety of factors, including pay, classroom performance, commitment to the profession, preparation, and the possibility of promotion and career development. Teachers in Tanzania already in the profession have lower levels of motivation in urban primary schools. One third of them say they would not make the same career choice again if given a chance (Bennel & Mukyanuzi, 2005). On the contrary, 80% of primary school teachers teaching in rural areas in Tanzania reported that they would take teaching career if they had a chance again. Bennel and Mukyanuzi (2005) assert that teachers in rural areas have extended families nearby and social networks as well as greater commitment to their community, which give them a kind of satisfaction.

The higher the motivation level, the greater teachers job performance or if teacher's motivation is increased, the more they increase their job performance. Motivation hence produces employees' satisfaction and helps in the achievement of organization goals on time, efficiency increases and the cost of production is reduced.

Results of hypothesis testing

In order to find out whether the observed differences in motivation strategies were statistically significant the study tested the null hypothesis, which stated that;

Ho: There is no statistically significant difference in the strategies used to motivate teachers in rural and urban primary schools in Embu and Kirinyaga Counties, Kenya.

To test this hypothesis the t-test was computed. The results of the t-test indicated that the level of significance .834 was more than the p-value (.05). This was interpreted to mean that there was no significant difference between the strategies used to motivate teachers from Embu and Kirinyaga counties in Kenya. Therefore, the null hypothesis was rejected at ($\alpha = .05$). The conclusion was that there is no significant difference between the strategies used to motivate teachers from the two counties. The result of the null hypothesis testing is illustrated in Table 3.

Table 3. Results of t-test on Strategies used to Motivate Teachers in Rural and Urban primary Schools

		Levene's Test for Equality of Variances		t-test for Equality of Means		Sig. (2-tailed)	Mean Difference	Std. Error Difference	95% Confidence	
		F	Sig.	t	df				Lower	Upper
Strategies used to motivate teachers	Equal variances assumed	1.895	.170	.210	170	.834	.02774	.13216	-.23316	.28863
	Equal variances not assumed			.257	73.295	.798	.02774	.10775	-.18700	.24248

Generally, the study revealed that the strategies used to motivate teachers in rural and urban primary schools were the same. The study revealed that the difference in academic performance among pupils in rural and urban primary schools cannot be attributed to strategies used to motivate teachers. The Herzberg motivation-hygiene theory explains that there are factors that motivate productivity of individuals in the work place (Wasseman &Wasseman, 2020). The motivators are the psychological factors such as recognition, respect for autonomy in job performance, involvement in decision making and respect of personal space at work referred to as the satisfiers. The hygiene factors consist of the job-related conditions of work such as salary, allowances and terms of service referred to as dissatisfies. Iliya and Ifeoma (2015) assert that motivation of teachers is largely influenced by intrinsic factors, namely; feeling of achievement, recognition, self-respect, and responsibility. However, teachers are demotivated by, excessive workload, poor pay, lack of career development, autocratic administrative style, facilities and resources. The findings of the study hence demonstrate that the apparent differences in performance among teachers from the two counties probably could be arising from the psychological characteristics as opposed to the motivational strategies used.

CONCLUSION AND RECOMMENDATIONS

The study established that the strategies used in motivating teachers in rural and urban schools were largely ineffective, therefore, there is need to investigate other causal factors to teacher motivation in both contexts. The study recommends the need to investigate the working conditions of teachers, opportunities for career development, remuneration, availability and adequacy of resources and leadership styles in schools as causal factors to low teacher morale in primary schools in Embu and Kirinyaga Counties, Kenya.

REFERENCES

- Aacha, M (2010): *Motivation and the Performance of Primary School Teachers in Uganda: A Case of Kimaanya-Kyabakuzi Division, Masaka District*. Makerere University, Uganda
- Akyeampong, K. & Stephens, D. (2002). Exploring the Backgrounds and Shaping of Beginning Student Teachers in Ghana: Toward Greater Contextualization of Teacher Education. *International Journal of Educational Development* 22 (3-4): 262-274.
- Alam, M., & Farid, S. (2011). Factors affecting teacher's motivation. *International Journal of Business and Social Science*, 2(1), 298-304.
- Allen, R. & Helms, M. (2006). Linking Strategic Practices and Organizational Performance to Porter's Generic Strategies. *Business Process Management Journal*. 12. 433-454.

- Ankomah, A. Y. (2005). The Success Story of Private Basic Schools in Ghana: The Case of Three Schools in Cape Coast. *Journal of Educational Management* 4, 1-4.
- Armstrong, M. (2009). How to be an effective manager? New Delhi: Universal Book Stall.
- Aswathappa, K. (2003). Organizational Behavior: Work Stress, 515 – 531.
- Azam, J. P. (2001). The redistributive state and conflicts in Africa. *Journal of Peace Research* 38 (4) 429-444.
- Bennell, P. & Akyeampong, K., (2005). Teacher motivation in Sub-Saharan Africa and South Asia. Education Paper prepared for DFID, Brighton: Knowledge and Skills for Development. *International Journal of Social Science & Interdisciplinary Research*, 1(12), ISSN 2277 3630
- Benveniste, L. & McEwan, P. (2000). Constraints to implementing educational innovations. The case of multigrade schools. *International Review of Education* 46, 31-48.
- Berger, L.A. (2002) *The compensation handbook in a state-of-art guide to compensation strategy*. USA: McGraw-Hill, Inc.
- Brown, D. L. (2003). *Challenges for Rural America in the 21st century*. University Park, PA: Pennsylvania State University press.
- CFBT. (2012). *Partnership with non-governmental organisations in education – a review of the role of women's self-help groups in Andhra Pradesh. Endline survey report*. Reading: CfbT Education Trust.
- Chijioke, C., & Barber, M. (2010). *How the world's most improved school systems keep getting better*. London: McKinsey & Company.
- Davidson, E. (2005). *The pivotal role of teacher motivation in Tanzania*. Haki Elimu Working Papers, 1-10.
- Gardner, R. C. (2005). *Motivation and attitudes in second language learning. Encyclopedia of Language and Linguistics*, (Second Edition). Oxford, UK: Elsevier.
- Global Campaign for Education (2005) *Teachers for All: What Governments and Donors Should Do?* Cape Town: GCE.
- Global Campaign for Education report (2005). *Global Campaign for Education Reproductive Health Matters*. 13(25), 19-22
- Harding, J. B. & Mansaray, A. T. (2005) *Teacher Motivation and Incentives in Sierra Leone. Division of Educational Studies: University of Sierra Leone*. Available at: <http://www.eldis.org/go/home&id=33287&type=Document#.V0ItlxN96Jc> [Accessed 10 May 2020]
- Hedges, J. (2002). The importance of posting and interaction with the education bureaucracy in becoming a teacher in Ghana. *International Journal of Education Development*. 22, 353-366.
- Hofstede, G. J. (2005) *Culture and organization. Software of the mind*. USA; McGraw-Hill, Inc.
- Hoy, W. K. & Miskel, C. G. (1991). *Educational Administration: Theory, Research, and Practice*. New York: McGraw-Hill.
- Iliya, A., & Ifeoma, L.G. (2015) Assessment of Teacher Motivation in Less Developed countries. *Journal of Education and Practice*, 6(22), 10-17.
- Ingersoll, R. (2001). Teachers turnover and teachers shortages. An organizational analysis. *American Research Journal* 38(3), 499-534.
- Kadzamira, E. (2006). *Teacher motivation and incentives in Malawi*. University of Malawi, Malawi.
- Kerlinger, F. N. (2000). *Foundations of Behavioral Research*. San Diego, CA Harcourt College Publishers.
- Komberger, M., & Pitsis, T. (2005). *Managing and organizations: an introduction to theory and practice*. London: Sage.
- Lawler, E. (2003). *Reward Practices and Performance Management System Effectiveness. Organizational Dynamics*. 32. 396-404.
- Markel, S. (2004). The condition of teacher quality in Arizona.
- Mugenda, O. M. & Mugenda, A.G. (2003). *Research methods quantitative and qualitative approaches*: Nairobi, Acts Press.
- Mulkeen, A. (2005). Teachers for rural schools. A challenge for Africa working paper. Biennale on Education in Africa (Libreville, March 27-31, 2006). An association for the development of education in Africa.
- Mullins, L. J. (2007). *Management and organizational behaviour*. 8th Edition. Prentice Hall.
- Nadeem, M., Shaheen, M. & Lone, A. (2011). *Teacher's Competencies and Factors Affecting the Performance of Female Teachers in Bahawalpur* (Southern Punjab) Pakistan. 2.
- Nelson. M. F. (2005). *Emerging Voices: A report on education in South African rural communities*. Available at: https://www.nelsonmandela.org/images/uploads/Emerging_Voices.pdf.
- Odden, A. (2000). *New and better forms of teacher compensation are possible*. Phi Delta Kappan. 81. 361-366.
- Onanda, B. (2015). The Effects of Motivation on Job Performance. *International Journal of Scientific and Research Publications*, 5(5), 2250- 3153.
- Pitsoe, V. J. (2013). Teacher Attrition in South Africa: Trends, Challenges and Prospects. *Journal of Social Sciences*. 36. 309-318.
- Rihani, M. A. (2009). *Academy for Educational Development*, Washington, D.C. (aedkeepingpromisegirlseedschooledu.pdf-Adobe Reader).
- Rosenbloom, J. S. (2005) *The hand book of employee benefits, design, funding and administration*. USA: McGraw-Hill Companies, Inc.

- Rust, V. & Dalin, P. (1990). *Teachers and Teaching in the Developing World*. New York: Garland.
- Segun, O.A. & Olanrewaju, O. (2011). *Improving the conditions of teachers and teaching in rural schools across African countries*. Addis Ababa: UNESCO.
- Sirima, L. C. N & Poipoi, M. W. (2010). Perceived factors influencing public secondary School teachers' job satisfaction in Busia District, Kenya. *Journals of Educational Research*, 1(1), 99-105.
- Spear, M., Gould, K., & Lee, B. (2000). *Who would be a teacher? A review of factors motivating and demotivating prospective and practicing teachers*. Slough, UK: National Foundation for Educational Research.
- Stone, F. M. (2003) *The managers question and answer book*. USA: AMACOM.
- Thomas, K. W. (2002) *Intrinsic motivation at work: Building energy and commitment*. San Francisco: Berrett-Koehler Publishers, Inc.
- Torrington, D. H. (2002) *Human Resource Management*. Prentice Hall.
- Tucker, C. (2011). Online Display Advertising: Targeting and Obtrusiveness. *Marketing Science*. 30. 389-404. 10.2307/23012474.
- UNDP. (2009). *Revision of World Urbanization Prospects*. <http://unstats.un.org/unsd/methods/m49/m49.htm>
- UNDP. (2015). *Human Development Report. Human Development for Everyone*. UNDP.
- UNESCO. (2015) *Education for All Global Monitoring Report. Policy Paper 19*. Available at: <http://unesdoc.unesco.org/images/0023/002327/232721E.pdf> [Accessed 2 May 2016]
- UNESCO. (2016). *Incheon declaration and Framework for action for the implementation of Sustainable Development Goal 4. Towards inclusive and equitable quality education and lifelong learning opportunities for all*. Education 2030. Paris: UNESCO.
- Vegas, E. & Umansky, J. (2005). *Improving teaching and learning through incentives. Incentives to improve teaching: lessons from Latin America*: Washington DC: World Bank.
- Velez, S. (2007). *What is motivation?* Ezine articles. Retrieved December 5, 2011, from
- Wadesango, N. (2012). The Influence of Teacher Participation in Decision-making on Student Performance. *Anthropologist*. 14. 425-431.
- Wasseman, T. & Wasseman, L. (2020). *Motivation efforts and the neutral network model*. New York: Springer.
- Wayne, F. C. (2006). *Managing Human Resources Productivity, Quality of Work Life, Profits Eighth Edition*. The Business School University of Colorado Denver.